

**Differing Site Condition Claims:
Technical Analysis, Presentation,
and
Adjudication of Entitlement**

by

PETER J. TARKOY, PH.D.

GEOTECHNICAL AND UNDERGROUND CONSTRUCTION CONSULTANT



GeoConSol, Inc.

17 Everett Street, MA 01770

Fax: (508) 650-3688 **Office:** (508) 650-3600

E-mail: PJT@GeoConSol.Com

PRIVATE COMMUNICATION -- BUSINESS CONFIDENTIAL

**This is an unpublished work of authorship protected by the copyright laws of the USA.
It may not be reproduced, copied, published, or loaned to other parties without the express
written consent of the author.**

Copyright 1991-2006 by Peter J. Tarkoy

3-Apr-07

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Introduction	2
Concept of Differing Site Conditions.....	2
Historical Development and Role of the Differing Site Condition Clause	2
Rationale of this Book.....	3
Intent and Content	5
Outline	5
Case Histories	5
Exercises	6
2. Fundamental Perspectives, Concerns, Privileges, and Responsibilities.....	7
Owner.....	7
Desire for a Working Facility.....	7
Cost Considerations	7
Schedule Considerations.....	8
Risk.....	9
Engineer.....	10
Project Feasibility Stage	10
Design Stage	11
Site Investigation	12
Geotechnical Data Reports.....	13
Geotechnical Interpretive Reports	13
Presentation of Exploration Data.....	14
Geotechnical Baseline Reports	16
Construction Stage	17
Contractor.....	18
Contract Provisions.....	18
Site Investigations.....	18
Reliance	20
Notice.....	21
Mitigating Impact.....	21
Record Keeping	22
Dimensions of Time and Space.....	22
Responsibilities of the Owner, Engineer, and Contractor.....	22
Records	23
Pre-bid	23
Bid	24
Pre-Notice to Proceed	24
Contract.....	24
Construction	24
3. Elements of a Differing Site Condition.....	27
The Differing Site Condition Clause	27
List of Technical Elements	29
Site Conditions.....	31
Reasonable Anticipated Conditions.....	32

Credible Encountered Conditions.....	33
Differences between Anticipated & Encountered Conditions.....	35
Construction Performance	35
Reasonable Anticipated Construction Performance.....	37
Verifiable Encountered Construction Performance	38
Differences between Anticipated and Encountered Performance.....	39
Stable Geology, Construction Disturbance, & "Ground Response"	40
Cause and Effect Relationships	41
Impact	42
Fulfilling Contract Requirements	44
Other Considerations / Other Causes.....	45
4. The Process of Resolution	47
Analysis	47
Presentation	47
Dealing with Parties.....	47
Contractor	47
Attorneys.....	48
Experts.....	48
Judges	49
Arbitrators / Arbitration.....	49
Disputes Review Boards	50
Juries	51
5. Recognizing Differing Site Conditions.....	52
Difference in Performance	52
Difference in Conditions	53
6. Exercises	56
Introduction	56
Exercise 1 - Development of Anticipated Conditions and Performance.....	56
Description of Project "A-1"	56
Assignment for Project "A-1"	57
Data for Project "A-1".....	58
Solutions for Project A-1:.....	62
Exercise 2 - Presentation, Analysis, and Approval of a DSC Claim	63
Description of Project A-2:.....	63
Assignment for Project "A-2"	63
Data for Project "A-2".....	64
Solutions for Project "A-2"	67
Outcome of Project "A-2"	69
Exercise 3 – Presentation, Analysis, and Adjudication of a DSC Claim	70
Description of Project "B-1"	70
Assignment for Project "B-1"	70
Data for Project "B-1".....	71
Solutions for Project "B-1"	76
Exercise 4 – Presentation, Analysis, and Adjudication of a DSC Claim	77
Description of Project "B-2"	77
Assignment for Project "B-2"	77

Evaluation of Project "B-2"	77
Data for Project "B-2"	78
Solutions for Project "B-2"	80
Outcome of Project "B-2"	83
7. References	84
8. Tables	86
9. Figures	98
10. Appendices	109
Appendix A: Forms for Effective Documentation of Encountered Conditions and Construction Performance	110
Appendix B: The Stuff That Claims Are Made Of	120

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Recommendations for the Presentation of Reasonable Anticipated Conditions	87
Table 2: Recommendations for the Review of Reasonable Anticipated Conditions	88
Table 3: Recommendations for the Presentation of Verifiable Encountered Conditions.....	88
Table 4: Recommendations for the Review of Verifiable Encountered Conditions	89
Table 5: Recommendations for the Presentation of Differences in Conditions	89
Table 6: Recommendations for the Review of Differences in Conditions.....	90
Table 7: Recommendations for the Presentation of Reasonable Anticipated Performance	91
Table 8: Recommendations for the Review of Reasonable Anticipated Performance.....	92
Table 9: Recommendations for the Presentation of Verifiable Encountered Performance	92
Table 10: Recommendations for the Review of Verifiable Encountered Performance	93
Table 11: Recommendations for the Presentation of Differences in Performance.....	93
Table 12: Recommendations for the Review of Differences in Performance	94
Table 13: Recommendations for the Presentation of Cause and Effect Relationships.....	94
Table 14: Recommendations for the Review of Cause and Effect Relationships	95
Table 15: Recommendations for the Presentation of IMPACT.....	95
Table 16: Recommendations for the Review of Impact	96
Table 17: Recommendations for the Presentation of Fulfilling Contract Requirements.....	96
Table 18: Recommendations for the Review of Fulfilling Contract Requirements	97
Table 19: Recommendations for the Presentation That No Other Conditions Were Responsible	97
Table 20: Recommendations for the Review to Determine That No Other Conditions Were Responsible.....	97

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: REASONABLE ANTICIPATED CONDITIONS (UCS Hi-Lo)	99
Figure 2: UNREASONABLE ANTICIPATED CONDITIONS (Bar).....	99
Figure 3: CREDIBLE ENCOUNTERED DATA (Hi-Lo)	99
Figure 4: NON-CREDIBLE ENCOUNTERED DATA (Frozen Weir).....	100
Figure 5: DIFFERENCE IN CONDITIONS (by Tunnel Zone).....	100
Figure 6: DIFFERENCE IN CONDITIONS (UCS / Hi-Lo).....	100
Figure 7: NO DIFFERENCE IN CONDITIONS (Water Inflow).....	101
Figure 8: BASIS OF REASONABLE PERFORMANCE.....	101
Figure 9: BASIS OF UNREASONABLE PERFORMANCE	101
Figure 10: CATERPILLAR RIPPABILITY CHART.....	102
Figure 11: UNREASONABLE ANTICIPATED PERFORMANCE	103
Figure 12: VERIFIABLE PERFORMANCE (Dredge Rate).....	103
Figure 13: UNVERIFIABLE PERFORMANCE (Downtime)	103
Figure 14: DIFFERENCE IN PERFORMANCE (Rate/3-D Surface).....	104
Figure 15: NO DIFFERENCE IN PERFORMANCE (Dredge Capacity)	104
Figure 16: STABILITY, CONSTRUCTION DISTURBANCE, AND CONSEQUENCES	105
Figure 17: CAUSE AND EFFECT RELATIONSHIP (Quartz Content-Penetration Rate).....	106
Figure 18: CAUSE AND EFFECT RELATIONSHIP (UCS-Drill Rate)	106
Figure 19: NO CAUSE AND EFFECT RELATIONSHIP (Weekly Inflow)	106
Figure 20: NO CAUSE AND EFFECT RELATIONSHIP (Daily Inflow).....	107
Figure 21: IMPACT OF OVERBREAK (Time-Progress).....	107
Figure 22: IMPACT OF OVERBREAK (MMSD - Labor Efficiency)	107
Figure 23: NO ADVERSE IMPACT (Dredging Gravel).....	108
Figure 24: EQUIPMENT CONDITION (Pump Efficiency).....	108

LIST OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit A-1: Profile of Courthouse Drain	58
Exhibit A-2: Boring Logs B-1 & 2 for Courthouse Drain.....	59
Exhibit A-3: Tabulation of Anticipated Site Conditions (Courthouse Drain).....	61
Exhibit A-4: Applicable Empirical Pipe-Jacking Experience	61
Exhibit A-5: Construction Record Tabulation/Calculations for Courthouse Drain.....	64
Exhibit A-6: Exercise in the Difference in Conditions (Courthouse Drain).....	65
Exhibit A-7: Exercise in the Difference in Performance (Courthouse Drain)	65
Exhibit A-8: Exercise in the Cause and Effect Relationship (Courthouse Drain).....	66
Exhibit A-9: Exercise in Impact (Courthouse Drain)	66
Exhibit B- 1: Bid Schedule	71
Exhibit B- 2: Rock Removal Bid Item	71
Exhibit B- 3: Specified Method of Rock Excavation Measurement.....	71
Exhibit B- 4: Classifications & Definitions (a) for Rock Excavation.....	72
Exhibit B- 5: Classifications & Definitions (b) for Rock Excavation.....	72
Exhibit B- 6: Encountered Rock Quantities To Date.....	72
Exhibit B- 7: Exercise in the Difference in Rock Quantities	73
Exhibit B- 8: Exercise in Entitlement	73
Exhibit B- 9: Exercise in the Effect of Unanticipated Rock	74
Exhibit B- 10: Exercise in the Impact of Unanticipated Rock.....	75

LIST OF FORMS

FORM 1: ROCK TUNNEL GEOLOGICAL LOG	111
FORM 2: TBM PERFORMANCE SHIFT REPORT	112
FORM 3: PILE SOCKET DRILLING REPORT	114
FORM 4: PIPE JACKING REPORT.....	116
FORM 5: SOFT GROUND EXCAVATION REPORT	118